

## Lets Have A transparent Debate – Comments on the article *“Is there a case for British Muslims to be exempted from the new opt out organ donation law”*

*Prof Saeed Ahmed1 MBBS, MD, FRCP, BSc.*

*Clinical Director Medical Specialties at South Tyneside and Sunderland NHS Foundation Trust. Consultant Nephrologist*

Correspondences [saeed.ahmed1@nhs.net](mailto:saeed.ahmed1@nhs.net)

Dear Editor

I would like to pass commentary on the article you published titled “Is there a case for British Muslims to be exempted from the new opt out organ donation law” authored by Abid Hussein. I welcome this article and the discussions that will follow. I think the discourse have moved on from some of the points made but I think it would be important to have such discussion. The article is obviously written in a provocative manner to allow for discourse.

It would have been in my opinion better if it was more balanced allowing therefore an informed choice to be made by the reader. The background to the article is the health inequalities that exist due to the increasing need of Muslims requiring organ donation from the National Organ Donation scheme. This leads to the position that the majority of Muslims will receive an organ from a non-Muslim and from the majority white community.

The first point to raise regarding donation and the proposal of harvesting organs in somebody critically unwell in Intensive Care using a limited harvest of part of a liver or kidney. This has to be balanced with the GMC of good practice principal which is first to do no harm and also has to take the risk balance equation of actually provoking death in a critically ill patient. This is probably not a practical solution to the issue.

The second point is if death either by DBD or DCD is not seen as permissible to donate organs then by that logic no Muslims should accept any organ from the organ donor

waiting list. If this position was taken, then the health inequalities will be exacerbated leading to an excessive

mortality in the Muslim population and increase health burden on Muslims waiting longer on the organ donor list if they were ever to be transplanted.

The third point is a societal perspective not donating but happy to receive would also in the context of islamophobia would probably lead to a division in the community between Muslims and non-Muslims. This will heighten the fever of islamophobia and increase the risk of isolation within a community.

I think the above 3 points need to be considered wisely. We should welcome the author into the wider discussion and discourse as he has a lot to offer and challenging positions should be discussed to allow the audience to make an informed choice with a balanced argument.